

Ashley M. Simonsen (State Bar. No. 275203)
COVINGTON & BURLING LLP
1999 Avenue of the Stars
Los Angeles, CA 90067
Telephone: + 1 (424) 332-4800
Facsimile: +1 (650) 632-4800
Email: asimonsen@cov.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Meta Platforms, Inc.;
Instagram, LLC; Meta Payments, Inc.; and Meta
Platforms Technologies, LLC*

[Additional Counsel Listed on Signature Page]

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

People of the State of California, et al.

v.

Meta Platforms, Inc., Instagram, LLC, Meta
Payments, Inc., Meta Platforms Technologies,
LLC

IN RE: SOCIAL MEDIA ADOLESCENT
ADDICTION/PERSONAL INJURY PRODUCTS
LIABILITY LITIGATION

THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:

4:23-cv-05448.

MDL No. 3047

Case No.: 4:22-md-3047-YGR-PHK

4:23-cv-05448-YGR

**STIPULATION AND ~~PROPOSED~~
ORDER SETTING FORMAT FOR
DECEMBER 20, 2024 JOINT LETTER
BRIEF RE OUSTANDING STATE
AGENCY DISCOVERY DISPUTES**

Judge: Hon. Yvonne Gonzalez Rogers

Magistrate Judge: Hon. Peter H. Kang

Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 7-12, the State Attorneys General (“State AGs”) and Meta Platforms, Inc.; Instagram, LLC; Meta Payments, Inc.; and Meta Platforms Technologies, LLC (collectively, “Meta,” and together, “Parties”), through their undersigned counsel, hereby stipulate as follows:

1. On December 9, 2024, the Parties filed a joint letter brief (“December 9 Joint Letter Brief”) regarding outstanding disputes between Meta and the state agencies identified in footnotes 2, 3, and 4 of the December 9 Joint Letter Brief. ECF 1430.

2. The Court (Magistrate Judge Kang) heard argument on the disputes at the December 11, 2024 Discovery Management Conference and made certain rulings.

3. The Parties have continued to confer about the disputes, have resolved certain disputes, and have agreed to submit a joint letter brief on December 20, 2024 regarding any outstanding disputes they have been unable to resolve (the “December 20 Joint Letter Brief”).

4. The Parties have agreed, subject to the Court’s permission, to use the following format for the December 20 Joint Letter Brief. For each State for which outstanding disputes remain with agencies within that State, the Parties will include:

a. One joint sentence stating the number of agencies within the State for which disputes remain and the names of the agencies.

b. One joint sentence identifying, with bullet points, any attached exhibits pertinent to the disputes, with the exhibits limited to: (a) proposed search terms, (b) proposed custodians, (c) proposed targeted searches, and (d) search term hit reports, *e.g.*:

- Exhibit 1A: The agencies’ proposals for search terms, custodians, and targeted searches for each agency at issue.
- Exhibit 1B: Meta’s proposals for search terms, custodians, and targeted searches for each agency at issue.
- Exhibit 1C: The most recent hit reports the agencies have provided to Meta

c. No more than five sentences per side (with all agencies of the State at issue addressed in the 5 sentences allocated for that State) stating that side’s position on the disputes.

1 5. The Parties have agreed that any agency hit reports attached as exhibits will clearly
2 identify:

- 3 a. The search terms that were run, either by (a) referencing the exhibit number
4 containing the search terms or (b) attaching a list of the search terms as they were run;
5 b. The number of custodians searched;
6 c. The date range used;
7 d. Whether the hit counts are or are not deduplicated across the custodians searched;
8 e. The date the hit report was shared with Meta.

9 6. The Parties have agreed that any proposed targeted searches attached as exhibits will
10 contain only a neutral description of the proposed targeted searches, analogous to a neutral list of search
11 terms, list of custodians, or hit report, with no argument. The Parties will endeavor to make any
12 proposed targeted searches attached as exhibits as uniform as possible in format.

13
14 **IT IS SO STIPULATED AND AGREED.**

15 ///
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1 DATED: December 19, 2024

Respectfully submitted,

2 **ROB BONTA**

3 Attorney General
4 State of California

5 /s/ Bernard Eskandari

6 Nicklas A. Akers (CA SBN 211222)
7 Senior Assistant Attorney General
8 Bernard Eskandari (SBN 244395)
9 Emily Kalanithi (SBN 256972)
10 Supervising Deputy Attorneys General
11 Nayha Arora (CA SBN 350467)
12 David Beglin (CA SBN 356401)
13 Megan O'Neill (CA SBN 343535)
14 Joshua Olszewski-Jubelirer (CA SBN 336428)
15 Marissa Roy (CA SBN 318773)
16 Brendan Ruddy (CA SBN 297896)
17 Deputy Attorneys General
18 California Department of Justice
19 Office of the Attorney General
20 455 Golden Gate Ave., Suite 11000
21 San Francisco, CA 94102-7004
22 Phone: (415) 510-4400
23 Fax: (415) 703-5480
24 Megan.ONeill@doj.ca.gov

25 *Attorneys for Plaintiff the People of the State of*
26 *California*

27 **PHILIP J. WEISER**

28 Attorney General
State of Colorado

/s/ Krista Batchelder

Krista Batchelder, CO Reg. No. 45066, *pro hac vice*
Senior Assistant Attorney General
Lauren M. Dickey, CO Reg. No. 45773, *pro hac vice*
First Assistant Attorney General
Megan Paris Rundlet, CO Reg. No. 27474
Senior Assistant Solicitor General
Elizabeth Orem, CO Reg. No. 58309
Assistant Attorney General
Colorado Department of Law
Ralph L. Carr Judicial Center
Consumer Protection Section

1 1300 Broadway, 9th Floor
2 Denver, CO 80203
3 Phone: (720) 508-6348
4 krista.batchelder@coag.gov

5 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Colorado, ex rel. Philip J.*
6 *Weiser, Attorney General*

7 **RUSSELL COLEMAN**
8 Attorney General
9 Commonwealth of Kentucky

10 /s/ Philip Heleringer

11 J. Christian Lewis (KY Bar No. 87109), *Pro hac vice*
12 Philip Heleringer (KY Bar No. 96748), *Pro hac vice*
13 Zachary Richards (KY Bar No. 99209), *Pro hac vice*
14 Daniel I. Keiser (KY Bar No. 100264), *Pro hac vice*
15 Matthew Cocanougher (KY Bar No. 94292), *Pro hac vice*
16 Assistant Attorneys General
17 1024 Capital Center Drive, Suite 200
18 Frankfort, KY 40601
19 CHRISTIAN.LEWIS@KY.GOV
20 PHILIP.HELERINGER@KY.GOV
21 ZACH.RICHARDS@KY.GOV
22 DANIEL.KEISER@KY.GOV
23 MATTHEW.COCANOUGH@KY.GOV
24 Phone: (502) 696-5300
25 Fax: (502) 564-2698

26 *Attorneys for Plaintiff the Commonwealth of Kentucky*

27 **MATTHEW J. PLATKIN**
28 Attorney General
State of New Jersey

/s/ Thomas Huynh

Kashif T. Chand (NJ Bar No. 016752008), *Pro hac vice*
Section Chief, Deputy Attorney General
Thomas Huynh (NJ Bar No. 200942017), *Pro hac vice*
Assistant Section Chief, Deputy Attorney General
Verna J. Pradaxay (NJ Bar No. 335822021), *Pro hac vice*
Mandy K. Wang (NJ Bar No. 373452021), *Pro hac vice*
Deputy Attorneys General
New Jersey Office of the Attorney General,
Division of Law

1 124 Halsey Street, 5th Floor
2 Newark, NJ 07101
3 Tel: (973) 648-2052
4 Kashif.Chand@law.njoag.gov
5 Thomas.Huynh@law.njoag.gov
6 Verna.Pradaxay@law.njoag.gov
7 Mandy.Wang@law.njoag.gov

8 *Attorneys for Plaintiff New Jersey Division of Consumer*
9 *Affairs*

10 **COVINGTON & BURLING LLP**

11 /s/ Ashley Simonsen
12 Ashley M. Simonsen, SBN 275203
13 COVINGTON & BURLING LLP
14 1999 Avenue of the Stars
15 Los Angeles, CA 90067
16 Telephone: (424) 332-4800
17 Facsimile: + 1 (424) 332-4749
18 Email: asimonsen@cov.com

19 Phyllis A. Jones, pro hac vice
20 Paul W. Schmidt, pro hac vice
21 COVINGTON & BURLING LLP
22 One City Center
23 850 Tenth Street, NW
24 Washington, DC 20001-4956
25 Telephone: + 1 (202) 662-6000
26 Facsimile: + 1 (202) 662-6291
27 Email: pajones@cov.com

28 *Attorney for Defendants Meta Platforms, Inc.; Instagram,*
LLC; Meta Payments, Inc.; and Meta Platforms
Technologies, LLC

SIGNATURE CERTIFICATION

Under Civ. L.R. 5-1(h)(3), I hereby attest that all signatories listed, and on whose behalf the filing is submitted, concur in this filing's content and have authorized this filing.

DATED: December 19, 2024

/s/ Ashley M. Simonsen

Ashley M. Simonsen
Counsel for Meta Platforms, Inc.; Instagram, LLC;
Meta Payments, Inc.; and Meta Platforms
Technologies, LLC

PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.

DATED: December 20, 2024

